



UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE
United States Patent and Trademark Office
Address: COMMISSIONER FOR PATENTS
P.O. Box 1450
Alexandria, Virginia 22313-1450
www.uspto.gov

APPLICATION NO.	FILING DATE	FIRST NAMED INVENTOR	ATTORNEY DOCKET NO.	CONFIRMATION NO.
10/561,259	04/28/2006	Alan David Borthwick	PB60266USW	2447
23347	7590	04/22/2008	EXAMINER	
GLAXOSMITHKLINE			SHAMEEM, GOLAM M	
CORPORATE INTELLECTUAL PROPERTY, MAI B475				
FIVE MOORE DR., PO BOX 13398			ART UNIT	PAPER NUMBER
RESEARCH TRIANGLE PARK, NC 27709-3398			1626	
			NOTIFICATION DATE	DELIVERY MODE
			04/22/2008	ELECTRONIC

Please find below and/or attached an Office communication concerning this application or proceeding.

The time period for reply, if any, is set in the attached communication.

Notice of the Office communication was sent electronically on above-indicated "Notification Date" to the following e-mail address(es):

USCIPRTP@GSK.COM
JULIE.D.MCFALLS@GSK.COM
LAURA.M.MCCULLEN@GSK.COM

Office Action Summary	Application No.	Applicant(s)	
	10/561,259	BORTHWICK	
	Examiner	Art Unit	
	Golam M. M. Shameem, Ph.D.	1626	

-- The MAILING DATE of this communication appears on the cover sheet with the correspondence address --

Period for Reply

A SHORTENED STATUTORY PERIOD FOR REPLY IS SET TO EXPIRE 3 MONTH(S) OR THIRTY (30) DAYS, WHICHEVER IS LONGER, FROM THE MAILING DATE OF THIS COMMUNICATION.

- Extensions of time may be available under the provisions of 37 CFR 1.136(a). In no event, however, may a reply be timely filed after SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.
- If NO period for reply is specified above, the maximum statutory period will apply and will expire SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.
- Failure to reply within the set or extended period for reply will, by statute, cause the application to become ABANDONED (35 U.S.C. § 133). Any reply received by the Office later than three months after the mailing date of this communication, even if timely filed, may reduce any earned patent term adjustment. See 37 CFR 1.704(b).

Status

1) Responsive to communication(s) filed on 12 March 2008.
 2a) This action is **FINAL**. 2b) This action is non-final.
 3) Since this application is in condition for allowance except for formal matters, prosecution as to the merits is closed in accordance with the practice under *Ex parte Quayle*, 1935 C.D. 11, 453 O.G. 213.

Disposition of Claims

4) Claim(s) 9-19 is/are pending in the application.
 4a) Of the above claim(s) 17-19 is/are withdrawn from consideration.
 5) Claim(s) _____ is/are allowed.
 6) Claim(s) 9-16 is/are rejected.
 7) Claim(s) _____ is/are objected to.
 8) Claim(s) _____ are subject to restriction and/or election requirement.

Application Papers

9) The specification is objected to by the Examiner.
 10) The drawing(s) filed on _____ is/are: a) accepted or b) objected to by the Examiner.
 Applicant may not request that any objection to the drawing(s) be held in abeyance. See 37 CFR 1.85(a).
 Replacement drawing sheet(s) including the correction is required if the drawing(s) is objected to. See 37 CFR 1.121(d).
 11) The oath or declaration is objected to by the Examiner. Note the attached Office Action or form PTO-152.

Priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119

12) Acknowledgment is made of a claim for foreign priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119(a)-(d) or (f).
 a) All b) Some * c) None of:
 1. Certified copies of the priority documents have been received.
 2. Certified copies of the priority documents have been received in Application No. _____.
 3. Copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been received in this National Stage application from the International Bureau (PCT Rule 17.2(a)).

* See the attached detailed Office action for a list of the certified copies not received.

Attachment(s)

1) Notice of References Cited (PTO-892)
 2) Notice of Draftsperson's Patent Drawing Review (PTO-948)
 3) Information Disclosure Statement(s) (PTO/SB/08)
 Paper No(s)/Mail Date 12/19/2005.

4) Interview Summary (PTO-413)
 Paper No(s)/Mail Date. _____.
 5) Notice of Informal Patent Application
 6) Other: _____.

DETAILED ACTION

Priority

This application is a 371 of PCT/EP04/06591 07/17/2004 and the claim of foreign priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119(a)-(d) to UK 0314370.8 06/19/2003 is acknowledged.

Status of Claims

Claims 9-19 are currently pending in the application. Claims 1-8 have been canceled.

Claims 17-19 are withdrawn from further consideration pursuant to 37 C.F.R. 1.142 (b) as being drawn to a non-elected subject matter.

Information Disclosure Statement

Receipt is acknowledged of Information Disclosure Statement (IDS), filed on 12/19/2005, which has been entered in the file.

Response to Election/Restriction

In response to the restriction requirement, Applicants have elected Group I, [Applicants proposed subject matter, which includes claims 9-16 drawn to a compound of the formula (I)] **without** traverse is acknowledged.

Applicants preserve their right to file a divisional on the non-elected subject matter.

Double Patenting

The nonstatutory double patenting rejection is based on a judicially created doctrine grounded in public policy (a policy reflected in the statute) so as to prevent the unjustified or improper timewise extension of the "right to exclude" granted by a patent and to prevent possible harassment by multiple assignees. See *In re Goodman*, 11 F.3d 1046, 29 USPQ2d 2010 (Fed. Cir. 1993); *In re Longi*, 759 F.2d 887, 225 USPQ 645 (Fed. Cir. 1985); *In re Van Ornum*, 686 F.2d 937, 214 USPQ 761 (CCPA 1982); *In re Vogel*, 422 F.2d 438, 164 USPQ 619 (CCPA 1970); and, *In re Thorington*, 418 F.2d 528, 163 USPQ 644 (CCPA 1969).

A timely filed terminal disclaimer in compliance with 37 CFR 1.321(c) may be used to overcome an actual or provisional rejection based on a nonstatutory double patenting ground provided the conflicting application or patent is shown to be commonly owned with this application. See 37 CFR 1.130(b).

Effective January 1, 1994, a registered attorney or agent of record may sign a terminal disclaimer. A terminal disclaimer signed by the assignee must fully comply with 37 CFR 3.73(b).

Claims 9-16 are subjected for rejection under the judicially created doctrine of obviousness-type double patenting, as being unpatentable over claims 1-6 of US 7,329,685, since the claims, if allowed, would improperly extend the “right to exclude” already granted in the patent. A reference anticipating one set of claims will render the other obvious and it would have been obvious to one of ordinary skill in the art at the time of the invention was made since US 7,329,685 ('685) teach the generic compounds and compositions which are similar to the instantly claimed compounds.

Claims 9-16 are also rejected under the judicially created doctrine of obviousness-type double patenting, as being unpatentable over claims 1-6 of co-pending application No. 10/499,529 (US '529). Although the conflicting claims are not identical, they are not patentably distinct from each other because both sets of claims are drawn to the same art recognized subject matter. This is a provisional obviousness-type double patenting rejection because the conflicting claims have not in fact been patented.

The subject matter claimed in the instant application is fully disclosed and covered in '685 patent and / or in US '529. Therefore, the disclosure of '685 patent or US '529 application that teach many permutation and combinations (including various Markush variable substitutions, such as X, Y and R¹ etc), which would easily place Applicant's invention in possession of the public at the time of Applicant's invention was filed. The indiscriminate selection of “some” among “many” is *prima facie* obvious, *In re Lemin*, 141 USPQ 814 (1964).

Therefore, in the instant case, one skilled in the chemical art would be motivated to choose to replace variable substitutions (such as Y) in permutation and combinations in core structure to obtain the desired products in view of the known teaching of the art. The claimed compounds are so closely related structurally to the homologous and /or analogous compounds of the reference as to be structurally obvious, therefore in the absence of any unobviousness or unexpected properties. Moreover, any other differences are but obvious structural modifications, which would be apparent to one skilled in the chemical art that can use similar substitutions, would expect to have the same or essentially the same results. Therefore, in looking at the instant claimed compounds as a whole, the claimed compounds would have been suggested to one skilled in the art unless unobvious or unexpected results can be shown.

Telephone Inquiry

Any inquiry concerning this communication or earlier communications from the examiner should be directed to Golem Shamed, Ph.D. whose telephone number is (571) 272-0706. The examiner can normally be reached on Tuesday-Friday from 8:30 AM - 4:30 PM.

If attempts to reach the examiner by telephone are unsuccessful, the examiner's supervisor, Joseph McKane, can be reached at (571) 272-0699. The Unofficial fax phone number for this Group is (703) 308-7921. The Official fax phone number for this Group is 571-273-8300.

When filing a FAX in Technology Center 1600, please indicate in the Header (upper right) "Official" for papers that are to be entered into the file, and "Unofficial" for draft documents and other communications with the PTO that are not for entry into the file of the application. This will expedite processing of your papers.

Communications via Internet e-mail regarding this application, other than those under 35 U.S.C. 132 or which otherwise require a signature, may be used by the applicant and should be addressed to [joseph.mCKane@uspto.gov]. All Internet e-mail communications will be made of record in the application file. PTO employees will not communicate with applicant via Internet e-mail where sensitive data will be exchanged or where there exists a possibility that sensitive data could be identified unless there is of record an express waiver of the confidentiality requirements under 35 U.S.C. 122 by the applicant. See the Interim Internet Usage Policy published by the Patent and Trademark Office Official Gazette on February 25, 1997 at 1195 OG 89.

Any inquiry of a general nature or relating to the status of this application should be directed to the Group receptionist, whose telephone number is (571) 272-1600.

/Golam M. M. Shameem, Ph.D./
Primary Examiner
Art Unit 1626,
Technology Center 1600

Application/Control Number: 10/561,259
Art Unit: 1626

Page 6

Application/Control Number: 10/561,259
Art Unit: 1626

Page 7